



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES AUGUST 14, 2024

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*
Keith Butler
Dennis Doordan
Michael Drury
Cass Ensberg
Ed Lenvik
Charles McClure
Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow
CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon
PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian
Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner
Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Vice Chair Hausz.

ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure
Commissioners absent: Grumbine
Staff present: Ted Hamilton-Rolle, PActing Design Review Supervisor (until 1:48 p.m.); Hernandez; Reidel; and Johnson

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

The following individual spoke:

1. Cheri Rae

Written correspondence from Stephen Fountain was acknowledged.

B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 31, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **July 31, 2024**, as submitted.
Action: Drury/Ooley, 7/0/1. (Lenvik abstained. Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **July 31, 2024**.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission Consent meeting of **July 31, 2024**, as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

D. Ratification of action taken on the Consent Calendar of **August 14, 2024**.

Consent Calendar August 14, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval 324 W Figueroa St	APN: 039-212-026 PLN: 2023-00496 Zone: R-MH	Dario Pini / Barton Millar	Project Design Approval with conditions
2.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 210 E Ortega St	APN: 031-152-002 PLN: 2024-00073 Zone: M-C	Jade Capital LLC Tyler Rameson, Representative Member / Jennifer Macisaac, Kevin Moore Architect	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions
3.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 1212 Castillo St	APN: 039-162-023 PLN: 2024-00012 Zone: R-MH	Terrance Alemann / Michael McGuire, McGuire Project Management	Project Design Approval and Final Approval

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **August 14, 2024**, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

E. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Mr. Hamilton-Rolle announced the Fall 2024 Board and Commission recruitment. City Council is expected to approve the schedule for recruitment at their August 27, 2024 hearing and applications will be open to follow. The Historic Landmarks Commission has four Commissioners with terms ending who will need to reapply if they wish to be reappointed. The application deadline is September 25, 2024 at 5:00 p.m. Interviews will be held on three dates in late October. Appointments occur on November 19, 2024. There is an open vacancy on Single Family Design Board (SFDB) and we ask that Commissioners help spread the word. If you or someone you know might be interested in applying, reach out to staff.

2. Vice Chair Hausz shared a book about the Atlantic Richfield building written by David Gebhard

F. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Doordan reported on the Objective Design and Development Standards.

(1:45PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**1. 3805 STATE ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 051-010-012, -013, and -014
 Zone: C-G/USS
 Application Number: PLN2024-00227
 Owner: MCP Santa Barbara LLC
 Matthew Taylor, Representative Member
 Applicant: Gelare Macon, Flowers & Associates, Inc.

(Project is not a historic site or within a historic district. Proposal to demolish the existing multi-story structure (Macy's) and associated parking, and construct a 689-unit mixed-use housing project under the City of Santa Barbara Average Unit Density (AUD) Program and SB 330.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Leftwich Archaeology. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations.

Actual time: 1:48 p.m.

Present: Brent Leftwich, Leftwich Archaeology; Gelare Macon, Flowers & Associates, Inc.; and Patsy Price, Community Development

Staff comments: Ms. Reidel stated that as this project is not at a historic site or in a historic district; only the archaeological report is within HLC's purview and the project itself will go to the Architectural Board of Review (ABR) for approval.

Public comment opened at 1:51 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Butler, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

(1:55PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION**2. 230 W VALERIO ST**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-091-016
 Zone: R-MH
 Reference Number: PLN2024-00003
 Owner: Sponsel, Robert & Chidlaw, Patricia Living Trust
 Robert Sponsel and Patricia Chidlaw, Trustees
 Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2024-06 designating the Craftsman style residence, constructed in 1912, a historic Structure of Merit.)

[Historic Significance Report*](#)
[Resolution 2024-06*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:53 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Mikki Jee was acknowledged.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2024-06 designating 230 West Valerio Street as a Structure of Merit.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

(2:05PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM

3. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATIONS

Reference Number: PLN2024-00003

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans and recommend to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act contracts for the properties listed below. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plans meet the criteria outlined in Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and have been recommended for HLC review by the HLC Designation Subcommittee at their meeting on July 15, 2024.)

1. 1723 Santa Barbara Street, Structure of Merit

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

2. 321 East Islay Street, Structure of Merit

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

3. 1126 Santa Barbara Street, Landmark

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

4. 1770 Prospect Avenue, Structure of Merit

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

5. 1516 De La Vina Street, Structure of Merit

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

6. 1334 Alameda Padre Serra, Structure of Merit

[Significance Report*](#)

[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 1:59 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:08 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Beverly Trial

Public comment closed at 2:14 p.m.

Motion: Recommendation to the Community Development Director to approve the Mills Act Contracts for 1723 Santa Barbara Street, 321 East Islay Street, 1126 Santa Barbara Street, 1770 Prospect Ave, 1516 De La Vina Street, and 1334 Alameda Padre Serra.

Action: Lenvik/Ooley, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

(2:30PM) MISCELLANEOUS ITEM

4. MILLS ACT CONTRACT APPLICATIONS

Reference Number: PLN2024-00003

Staff: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Review of proposed Mills Act Program Ten-Year Rehabilitation Plans and recommend to City Council to grant an exception to the Mills Act contract limits outlined in Santa Barbara Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and recommend that the Community Development Director approve the Mills Act contracts for the properties listed below. The proposed ten-year rehabilitation plans meet the criteria outlined in Municipal Code Section 30.157.145 and have been recommended for HLC review by the HLC Designation Subcommittee at their meeting on July 15, 2024.)

1. **1732 Santa Barbara Street, Landmark**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)
2. **2010 Garden Street, Structure of Merit**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)
3. **2050 Garden Street, Structure of Merit**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)
4. **1708 Paterna Road, Structure of Merit**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)
5. **1924 Anacapa Street, Structure of Merit**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

6. **107 Jorgensen Lane, Structure of Merit, Requesting renewal of 10-year contract, Requires City Council approval of renewal**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

7. **612 East Valerio Street, Structure of Merit, Requesting renewal of 10-year contract, Requires City Council approval of renewal**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

8. **403 Loma Alta Drive, Landmark Requesting renewal of 10-year contract, Requires City Council approval of renewal**
[Significance Report*](#)
[10-Year Proposed Scope of Work*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:16 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian; and Tom Stricklen, Owner, 2010 Garden Street

Public comment opened at 2:26 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Richard Goodstein

Public comment closed at 2:29 p.m.

Motion: Recommend to City Council to approve the Mills Act contracts for 1732 Santa Barbara Street, 2010 Garden Street, 2050 Garden Street, 1708 Paterna Road, 1924 Anacapa Street, 107 Jorgensen Lane, 612 East Valerio Street, and 403 Loma Alta Drive.

Action: Ooley/Drury, 8/0/0. (Grumbine absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:37 TO 2:52 P.M. ***

(3:00PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**5. 900 PHILINDA AVE**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-018
Zone: C-G
Application Number: PRE2024-00088
Owner/Applicant: Desoni Management, LLC
Vadim Kotlyar, Representative Member

(Designated a City Landmark, the Live Oak Dairy Building was designed in 1939 by Alexander D'Alfonso in the Streamline Moderne style. Proposal to relocate the iconic cow statue, which is a character defining feature.)

Request for feedback from the Historic Landmarks Commission on options for the new cow statue location.**Historic Significance Report***

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 2:52 p.m.

Present: Vadim Kotlyar, Representative Member

Public comment opened at 3:05 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Beverly Trial

Written correspondence from Pamela Boehr, Paulina Conn, and Betsy Cramer was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 3:08 p.m.

Commission comments:

- The Commission is saddened by the loss of the cow and the insurance ramifications to the property owner, should he replace the cow.
- Replace the cow with a replica in its original location. If that choice is not possible, then the Commission would accept the loss of the cow and suggests a plaque with image of the cow in bas relief to be installed on the Canon Perdido elevation of the building.
- The Commission encourages the Applicant to reach out to the City to see if there is a possibility they could help restore the cow to its Landmark position.

(3:30PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**6. 1501 FRANCESCHI RD**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-101-009
Zone: P-R
Application Number: PRE2024-00109
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Sean Stewart, Parks and Recreation Department

(Designated a Structure of Merit, the Franceschi Residence (Montarioso) was constructed in 1905. Franceschi Park itself is also historically significant. Proposal to demolish the Franceschi House and replace it with an interpretive garden terrace in its footprint per City Council recommendation. Project includes: salvage of commemorative features, construction of a new accessible parking lot, retaining walls, accessible pathways, and interpretive signage and landscaping; replacement of the circular plaza west of the house; and improvements to the existing view perch. The project will safely restore public access to the park, increase its sustainability and resiliency, and provide historical value to the community by commemorating the site's historical significance.

No final appealable decision will take place at this hearing. Project Compatibility Findings and Demolition Findings will be required for Project Design Approval.

Staff Report*

[Historic Structures/Sites Report for House \(2003\) Historic Significance portion only for reference*](#)

[Historic Structures/Sites Report for Site \(2003\) Historic Significance portion only for reference*](#)

**Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC*

Actual time: 3:33 p.m.

Present: Sean Stewart, Parks and Recreation Department; Kevin Dumain, Architect, DesignARC; Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian; and Scott Capps, Landscape Architect, EPTDesign

Public comment opened at 4:02 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Douglas Reed
3. Claudia Schou
4. Emiliano Marini
5. Beverly Trial

Written correspondence from Jim and Kathy Bybokas, Shelley Bookspan, Jan Everote, and Susan Chamberlin was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:20 p.m.

How many Commissioners can support losing the house? 7/8 Passed

How many Commissioners can support enlarging the patio? 8/8 Passed

How many Commissioners can support the terrace matching the exact footprint of the house? 5/8 Passed

How many Commissioners can support a more rustic alternative to the structured and formal sandstone walls? 8/8 Passed

Commission comments:

- The Commission is grateful for the thorough and informative presentation.
- The Commission does not accept the patio as proposed. Study alternatives that include something curvilinear or relating to the footprint of the house. Consider enlarging the patio.
- The walls should be more rustic and whimsical instead of formal sandstone. Suggestion for cast concrete with sandstone inclusions.
- The Commission accepts the loss of the house.
- Consider making the design less like a memorial and more celebratory.
- Accessibility is a big concern. Return with solutions.
- Study the compass rose to be more compatible with the design.
- The Commission is not supportive of the view scope.
- The landscaping is supportable. The Commission would support higher water use plants so that the landscape palette properly reflects Dr. Franceschi. Consider that trees may block views.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:52 P.M. ***