

# City of Santa Barbara HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES MARCH 27, 2024

1:30 P.M. David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 630 Garden Street <u>SantaBarbaraCA.gov</u>

#### **COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair* Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair* Keith Butler Dennis Doordan Michael Drury Cass Ensberg Ed Lenvik Charles McClure Robert Ooley

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Kristen Sneddon PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Donald DeLuccio

#### STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner Mariah Johnson, Commission Secretary

# CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:32 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

# **ATTENDANCE**

Commissioners present:	Grumbine, Haus McClure	z, Butler,	Drury,	Ensberg,	Lenvik,	Ooley,	and
Commissioners absent:	Doordan						
Staff present:	Hernandez (until 2:35 p.m.), Reidel, and Johnson						

# **GENERAL BUSINESS**

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of March 13, 2024, as amended.
 Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:
  - Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of March 27, 2024, as reviewed by Vice Chair Hausz and Commissioner McClure.
    Action: Ooley/Butler, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
  - 1. Ms. Hernandez announced that Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor, had her baby and is now on maternity leave.
  - 2. Vice Chair Hausz announced that the Santa Barbara Conservancy has been concerned about the lack of sign enforcement and presented a collage of unpermitted signs.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:

Commissioner Lenvik reported on the State Street Advisory Committee meeting of March 18, 2024.

Commissioner Ensberg and Chair Grumbine requested a State Street Interim Working Group meeting to discuss parklet guidelines.

#### (1:45PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

#### 1. 2010 GARDEN ST

Assessor's Parcel Number:	025-331-015
Zone:	RS-15
Reference Number:	PLN2024-00003
Owner:	Thomas Lee Strickland
Staff:	Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2024-01 designating the Mission style residence, Crocker Row #1, designed by noted architect, Arthur Page Brown in 1894 a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report\* <u>Resolution 2024-01\*</u> \*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Actual time: 1:51 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 1:58 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

- Motion: Adopt resolution 2024-01 designating the Mission style residence, Crocker Row #1, designed by noted architect, Arthur Page Brown in 1894 a historic Structure of Merit.
- Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

# (1:55PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

1303 LAS ALTURAS RDAssessor's Parcel Number:019-113-039Zone:RS-1AReference Number:PLN2024-00003Owner:Sheila LodgeStaff:Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2024-02 designating the Third Bay Tradition style structure designed in 1971, by Sheila Lodge a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report\* <u>Resolution 2024-02\*</u> \*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Actual time: 2:03 p.m.

2.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:11 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Sheila Lodge

3.

Public comment closed at 2:14 p.m.

- Motion: Adopt resolution 2024-02 designating the Third Bay Tradition style structure design in 1971 by Sheila Lodge, a historic Structure of Merit.
- Action: Ensberg/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

#### (2:05PM) STRUCTURE OF MERIT DESIGNATION

960 TREMONTO RDAssessor's Parcel Number:019-072-001Zone:RS-1AReference Number:PLN2024-00003Owner:Bielby, Denise D Trust 9/18/04Denise Bielby, TrusteeStaff:Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

(Request to adopt resolution 2024-03 designating the California Modern style structure designed in 1959/60 for the Kong family, that is significant for its association with the Chinese American Ethnic Heritage, a historic Structure of Merit.)

Historic Significance Report\* <u>Resolution 2024-03\*</u> \*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC Historic Landmarks Commission Minutes

Actual time: 2:18 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m.,

The following individual spoke:

1. Denise Bielby

Written correspondence from Concerned Citizen and taxpayer was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:31 p.m.

Motion: Adopt resolution 2024-03 designating the California Modern style structure designed in 1959/60 for the Kong family, that is significant for its association with the Chinese American Ethnic Heritage, a historic Structure of Merit.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

#### \* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:35 TO 2:40 P.M. \*

#### (2:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: DISCUSSION ITEM

4. DISCUSSION ON STATE STREET MASTER PLAN PROCESS Reference Number: PLN2024-00003 HLC Representative: Anthony Grumbine, HLC Chair

(A facilitated discussion by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) Chair on topics under the HLC's purview related to the State Street Master Plan. The Commission's comments will be submitted to the State Street Advisory Committee (SSAC) for consideration.)

#### Staff Memo\*

\*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Actual time: 2:40

Public comment opened at 3:14 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Written correspondence from Kevin Boss and Robert A. Curtis was acknowledged.

#### Discussion held.

# (3:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN APPROVAL AND FINAL APPROVAL

5.	1724 GARDEN ST				
	Assessor's Parcel Number:	027-121-019			
	Zone:	RS-15			
	Application Number:	PLN2023-00324			
	Owner:	Tam-Bullock Family Trust			
		Anthony Tam & Heidi Bullock, Trustees			
	Applicant/Architect:	Tom Henson, Becker Henson Niksto Architects			

(Listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory, constructed in 1903 in the Italian Mediterranean style. Proposal to construct a second-story rear addition to the existing 2,255-square-foot two-story single-unit residence, consisting of an 89-square-foot first floor addition, a 526-square-foot second floor addition, and a 390-square-foot uncovered raised patio. An existing 524-square-foot detached garage and 272-square-foot cabana will remain and are not under discretionary purview. The Staff Hearing Officer granted approval of a Solar Access Modification and an Interior Setback Modification on January 24, 2024. The proposed total of 3,666 square feet of development on a 15,222-square-foot parcel is 84% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR).)

# Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Project Compatibility Findings and Minor Alterations Findings are required. Project last reviewed on January 17, 2024.

Historic Significance Report\* <u>Memo to the Secretary of the Interior Standards\*</u> \*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Actual time: 3:43 p.m.

Present: Tom Henson, Becker Henson Niksto Architects; Morgan Solorio, Becker Henson Niksto Architects; Jessica Harlin, Landscape Architect, Barefoot Designs; and Holly Garcin, Assistant Planner, City of Santa Barbara

<u>Staff comments:</u> Ms. Garcin stated that the project was approved by the Staff Hearing Officer (SHO). When the project was last reviewed by the Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) the land use decisions were supported from an aesthetic standpoint. The Applicant has addressed the initial comments they received from the HLC. The project is before the Commission for Project Design Approval and Final Approval. Staff is requesting a Condition of Approval or forwarding the project to the Consent Calendar if Final Approval is not acceptable at today's meeting.

Public comment opened at 3:53 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

#### Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval with findings:

- 1. The Project Compatibility Analysis Findings generally have been met (per SBMC 30.220.020.F.) as follows:
  - a. The project's design is consistent with design guidelines applicable to its location within the City.
  - b. The design of the project is compatible with desirable architectural qualities and characteristics that are distinctive of Santa Barbara and of the particular neighborhood surrounding the project.
  - c. The size, mass, bulk, height, and scale of the project are appropriate.

- d. The design of the project is appropriately sensitive to adjacent Landmarks or other nearby designated historic resources.
- e. The design of the project responds appropriately to established scenic public vistas.
- f. The amount of open space and landscaping is appropriate.
- 2. As required for Resources on the Historic Resource Inventory in Section 30.157.110 of the Santa Barbara Municipal Code: The exterior alterations are being made primarily for, and will substantially advance, restoration of the Historic Resource to its original appearance; and the exterior alterations are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- Action: Hausz/Ensberg, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

#### \* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:57 TO 4:03 P.M. \*

#### (4:00PM) ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT

6. 17 - 21 W MONTECITO ST

Assessor's Parcel Number:	033-042-007
Zone:	HRC-2/SD-3
Application Number:	PLN2023-00147
Owner:	Paul Uyesaka
Applicant:	Craig Minus, CAM Land Use & Development

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to demolish existing structures and construct a new 27,647 square foot three-story hotel consisting of 44 guest rooms, a first-floor lobby, a reception area, lounge, grab & go, storage area, a roof deck, and underground 44-space garage for valet parking.)

Requesting acceptance of a Phase I Archaeological Resources Report, prepared by Samantha Murray, MA, RPA. Dr. Glassow reviewed the report and agrees with its conclusions and recommendations, specifically that an archaeological monitor should be present during all earth-moving activities.

Actual time: 4:03 p.m.

Present: Samantha Murray, South Environmental

Public comment opened at 4:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

#### Motion: Accept the report as submitted.

Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

Craig Minus, CAM Land Use & Development

# (4:05PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

7.	<u> 17 - 21 W MONTECITO ST</u>	
	Assessor's Parcel Number:	033-042-007
	Zone:	HRC-2/SD-3
	Application Number:	PLN2023-00147
	Owner:	Paul Uyesaka

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal to demolish existing structures and construct a new 27,647 square foot three-story hotel consisting of 44 guest rooms, a first-floor lobby, a reception area, lounge, grab & go, storage area, a roof deck, and underground 44-space garage for valet parking.)

No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings will be required for Project Design Approval. Project last reviewed on August 30, 2023.

#### Historic Structures/Sites Report\*

Applicant:

\*Available for view online at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC

Actual time: 4:07 p.m.

Present: Clay Aurell, AB Design Studio; Aaron Harel, Landscape Architect; and Kelly Brodison, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support plaster for the elevator tower? 4/4 Failed

#### Motion: Continue to the Planning Commission with comments:

- 1. The Commission is in favor of the project and feels it is ready for Planning Commission (PC). They thank the Applicant for addressing their previous comments well and encourage them as their project goes forward.
- 2. Add refinements to the front entry to give it more poetry and a particular character. Recommendation to pull references from the Mission Revival style of the train station.
- 3. Adjust the proportions of the garage openings. Narrow the opening, drop the height, add detail, and give more heft to the corner.
- 4. Refine the third-floor parapet wall above the walkway so that it has visual support. Suggestion to use brackets, bring down a sliver of wall, or add something to hold it up.
- 5. Either use wood post with wood beam or plaster pier with plaster beam on the right side third-floor corner.
- 6. The Commission is split on whether plaster or red tile would be more suitable for the elevator tower.
- 7. The Commission does not want to be able to see landscape on the roof deck from the sidewalk or right of way.
- 8. The window openings are too big. Add more plaster to the openings. Recommendation to lower the third-floor plaster and/or add detailing such as plaster corbels or something that feels enclosed and soft.
- 9. Break up the red roof with a cornice so that it reads as two buildings instead of one long one.

- 10. Recommendation for all cornice elements in the rear portion to be two by eight for the slope recess to have dept for the sill.
- 11. Update the 3D renderings and elevations to show full landscape.
- 12. The Commission appreciates the Applicant working the history of the motorcycle and family into the design.
- Action: Ooley/Hausz, 8/0/1. (Doordan absent.) Motion carried.

# \* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:16 P.M. \*