MEETING DATE: June 8, 2022

TO: Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC)

FROM: Nicole Hernandez, City Architectural Historian

SUBJECT: Staff Evaluation of proposed alterations


PROJECT: Proposal to demolish and reconstruct rear portion of the first floor to include expansion of the rear porch; the addition of a deck over the rear porch on the second floor at the east elevation; alterations of east elevation hipped roof to a gable; and addition of wood shingles to the rear gables. The project also proposes door and window changes, including the rehabilitation and reuse of the existing paired casement windows with diamond paned glass windows at the east elevation, addition of a second floor dormer on the north elevation; and the addition of windows along the first floor of the north elevation.

This memo, prepared by the City Architectural Historian evaluates the proposed project on the historic resource by determining if the project follows the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The purpose of this staff evaluation is to assist the Historic Landmarks Commission, in the review of a project when no Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report (HSSR) has been prepared and in order to guide applicants and Commissioners appropriately towards avoiding or lessening project impacts.

Compliance With the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.

   The property has been used as a residence since 1948 when it was converted from a barn. It will still be used as a residence and the proposed addition and alterations require minimal change to distinctive features, so that it will still be able to convey its original appearance so that the project meets Standard 1.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
The project meets Standard 2. Most of the alterations are on the rear east elevation and north elevation, that is not visible to the public right-of-way. The addition will repair and re-use the existing wood windows with diamond panes in the 2nd story and replace existing single pane casement windows with one set of French doors and transom to match the existing west elevation that lead out to an added balcony over the front porch. The board and batten in the gables will be replaced with wood shingles to match the shingles on the west elevation. The hipped roof will be replaced with a gable roof. All of the rest of the distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize the property will remain including:

- Picturesque, asymmetrical massing of the structure;
- Exterior board-and-batten siding on all elevations of the structure;
- Barge boards and distinctive rectangular shingles;
- Existing fenestration, diamond pane casement windows, including its doors and multi-light and single-light windows;
- Recessed front entry under the porch
- Front porch and second-floor balcony;
- Brick chimney, and
- The structure’s steeply-pitched gabled roofs.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

No conjectural features are proposed for the building.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

No changes to the house have acquired significance in their own right.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The project meets standard 5. The project is preserving and retaining the following distinctive materials, features, and finishes including the distinctive barn, picturesque massing, diamond pane and multi-light windows and board and batten siding except in the rear transoms will remain and all the original features will be retained and preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The project meets standard 6. Deteriorated elements, like the diamond pane casement windows will be rehabilitated and reused in the project.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

The project meets Standard 7. All work proposed will use the gentlest means possible to ensure no damage to historic materials.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

*This Standard is not applicable.*

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

*The project meets Standard 9 as the rear alterations are on the least visible elevation and will not impact the integrity of the public streetscape. The location and massing of the rear alterations are peripheral to the main house’s facade and are sited to have a minimal street presence. The proposed addition of the dormer and addition of new windows on the front elevation will not destroy any historic materials features or spatial relationships that characterize the property as the most distinguishing feature of the façade is the recessed entry under the arched porch, divided light casement windows and board and batten siding. The new dormers and windows will be made of wood to match existing materials. The proposed design incorporates the material and unique aesthetics of the historic residence so that it is compatible to the existing resource in materials, features, size and scale and proportion and massing to the original house. The rear façade will be distinguished from the original house with its shingles in the gables and new French doors and balconies.***

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

*The project meets standard 10. Because the alterations include changing the roofline of the rear elevation, the essential form of the rear elevation the essential form and integrity of the rear of the property would not be unimpaired if removed. However, the integrity of the front elevation and side elevations and the character defining features would remain in tact. If the front dormer were removed, the essential form and integrity of the property would be unimpaired.*

**ARCHITECTURAL HISTORIAN SUMMARY COMMENTS.** No Historic Structures/Sites Report is necessary at this time as the proposed alterations do not have a negative impact on the 1948 barn turned residence which will remain in-tact on the streetscape and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation. The project may therefore qualify for a categorical exemption with a less than significant impact to the resource, if the HLC consent reviewer agrees with the above evaluation and conclusions. Should the project significantly change, a Historic Structures Report may be required.