

City of Santa Barbara SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES JUNE 17, 2024

3:00 P.M. David Gebhard Public Meeting Room 630 Garden Street <u>SantaBarbaraCA.gov</u>

BOARD MEMBERS:

Jennifer Lewis, *Chair* Katie Gerpheide Dawn Sherry

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Mike Jordan

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor Sebastian Herics, Assistant Planner Joanie Saffell, Commission Secretary

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Lewis.

ATTENDANCE

Members present:	Lewis, Gerpheide, and Sherry
Members absent:	None
Staff present:	Ted Hamilton-Rolle, Project Planner; Herics and Saffell

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Single Family Design Board meeting of June 3, 2024, as amended.
Action: Lewis/Sherry, 2/0/1. (Gerpheide abstained.) Motion carried.

C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

Consent Calendar June 10, 2024:

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Concept Review 2540 Calle Galicia	APN:041-424-007 PLN:2024-00083 Zone:RS-15	Bruce D. & Laura M. Wallace Tod Stockwell, T Stock Design Studio	No Appealable Action Taken
2.	Concept Review 252 Santa Ynes Ct	APN:015-261-021 PLN:2024-00098 Zone:R-2	Gina E. Alcaraz Jose Sanchez, Design Studio 34	No Appealable Action Taken
3.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 129 Las Ondas	APN:045-212-006 PLN:2023-00396 Zone:E-3/S-D-3	Cameron Dexter Ernesto Botello	Project Design Approval and Final Approval with conditions.

Motion:Ratify the Consent Calendar of June 10, 2024, as reviewed by Board Member Gerpheide.Action:Lewis/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

Consent Calendar June 17, 2024: Staff to announce the action taken at the consent hearing

	REVIEW TYPE & ADDRESS	APN/PLN/ZONE	OWNER/APPLICANT	ACTION
1.	Project Design Approval and Final Approval 925 Jimeno Rd	APN:029-051-010 PLN:2024-00133 Zone: RS-15	Larry and Cindy Ameen/ Lauren Anderson, A34Studio	Project Design Approval and Final Approval
2.	Final Approval 1509 Shoreline Dr	APN:045-182-008 PLN:2021-00549 Zone:E-3/SD-3	Jarrett Gorin AICP, Vanguard Planning Inc./ Tom Ochsner, AIA	Final Approval
3.	Project Design Approval 952 Alameda Padre Serra	APN:019-252-015 PLN:2022-00319 Zone:RS-15	Gail Fisher/ Ellen Bildsten, Bildsten Architecture & Planning	Project Design Approval with Conditions
4.	Project Design Approval 1215 Diana Ln	APN:031-132-017 PLN:2024-00008 Zone:RS-7.5	Ted & Diana Richards/ Lovita Wibisono, Andrulaitis + Mixon Architects	Project Design Approval with Conditions

Motion:Ratify the Consent Calendar of June 17, 2024, as reviewed by Board Member Lewis.Action:Lewis/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
 - 1. Mr. Hamilton-Rolle announced the following:
 - a. There was an appeal of the SFDB's Final Approval of the project at 1269 Ferrelo Road. At its regular hearing on June 6, 2024, the Planning Commission upheld the Appeal and directed the Applicant to return to the SFDB for reconsideration of Final Approval after addressing the Commission's comments.

- b. Staff are pleased to announce the new member to SFDB, Shanar Moslehy, appointed on June 11, 2024, by City Council. Her term starts July 1, 2024, and her first meeting with SFDB will be on July 15, 2024.
- c. There is still a vacancy on the Board. Staff are looking at options to fill the vacancy without doing a separate recruitment currently. Staff will update the Board as needed, and if a recruitment must be opened that will be announced. The qualifications for the open position can be member at large or licensed architect.
- 2. Mr. Herics announced the following:
 - a. Those interested in the SFDB position can contact him at <u>SHerics@SantaBarbara.CA.gov</u>.
 - b. All meetings for SFDB hearings the week of July 1, 2024, are cancelled for July 4 holiday, there will be no Consent or Full Board meetings.

(3:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

1.	3205 BRAEMAR DR	
	Assessor's Parcel Number:	047-083-003
	Zone:	A-1/S-D-3
	Application Number:	PLN2023-00516
	Owner:	Pomerantz, Mark F & Laura C Revocable Trust
		Laura & Mark Pomerantz, Trustees
	Applicant:	April Palencia, Vanguard Planning Inc.

(Project proposes to remodel the existing 3,552-square-foot two-story single-unit residence and expand the existing second-story balcony, convert the existing 592-square-foot attached three-car garage to habitable space, construct a new attached 716-square-foot three-car garage with a 493-square-foot gym above and a 328-square-foot terrace above, and construct a detached 1,108-square-foot one-story standard Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). Project also includes remodeling the two existing driveway entrances, removal of a 79-square-foot shed, removal of four trees, and new landscape. The parcel is in the Coastal Zone Non-Appealable Jurisdiction. Review and approval of a Coastal Exemption is required for all work except the ADU. Review and approval of a Coastal Development for the ADU and a Zoning Modification to allow the required ADU parking space to be in the front setback is required by the Staff Hearing Officer. The proposed total of 6,461 square feet of development on a 44,420-square-foot lot is 130% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

No final appealable decision will take place at this hearing. Neighborhood Preservation Findings will be required when the project is reviewed for Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 3:18 p.m.

Present: Jarret Gorrin, Vanguard Planning, Inc.; and April Palencia, Vanguard Planning, Inc.

<u>Staff comments:</u> Holly Garcin, Assistant Planner, stated that this project is here for initial concept comments, and this is the first time this project has been before the Board. Staff would like comments specific to the scope and the one uncovered parking space in the front yard. Aesthetic appropriateness, to the siting of that space and what it looks like around that space and the location around the front yard. Is the Board okay with the screening in that location? The Zoning modification will go to the Staff Hearing Officer. This project is in its second round of thirty-day review, so if the Board can consider

providing these conceptual comments and sending the project off to the Staff Hearing Officer and returning the project for Project Design Approval and Final Approval.

Public comment opened at 3:31 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Dan George

Public comment closed at 3:37 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Staff Hearing Office and Full Board with comments:

- 1. The Board is generally in support of the proposed square footage. The proposed bulk, and scale appears too large from the front elevation.
- 2. The Board recommends studying the architectural language to commit to the style of home with consistent detailing, materials, and proportions.
- 3. The Board recommends studying the roof and height of the second story portion of the garage addition to minimize its overall bulk.
- 4. The Board recommends studying the proportion between plaster and glazing and including divided lights in the glazing on the front elevation.
- 5. The Board recommends studying the street elevation of the ADU to give it a more residential appearance.
- 6. The Board recommends studying the railing types and architectural detail types on the rear elevation, and consider Mediterranean details that help support the balconies, whether columns, corbels, etc.
- 7. The Board requests a site section that cuts through the pool and shows any retaining walls and the adjacent neighbor's property line.
- 8. The Board would like further understanding of the trees being removed and recommends finding an option to keep the existing Coral tree.
- 9. The Board would like to see the design intent of the gates at the driveways.
- 10. The Board generally is open to seeing vehicles parked in the ADU driveway in the front yard setback pending screening plants and/or appropriate gate.

Action: Lewis/Sherry, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

(3:55PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW

2. <u>313 VISTA DE LA CUMBRE</u>

Assessor's Parcel Number:	053-084-008
Zone:	RS-7.5/USS
Application Number:	PLN2024-00164
Owner:	Iwashita Family Trust
	Scott & Julia Iwashita
Applicant/Designer:	Andrew Blumm, All Blossoms, LLC

(Proposal to remodel the 14,780 square foot two-story home and add 908 square feet to the first floor and 1,039 square feet to the second floor, and demolish the existing detached garage, accessory studio, covered deck, and workshop shed. A new 105 square foot shed is proposed and uncovered parking in the rear of the property. New terraces, property line fencing, and site walls are proposed. Landscape plans are required prior to Project Design Approval. No trees are proposed for removal. As designed, the project requires a Minor Zoning Exception to covered parking requirements. The total proposed 3,443 square feet on a 14,899 square foot lot is 79% of the maximum required Floor Area Ration (FAR).)

No final appealable action will be taken at this hearing. Neighborhood Preservation Findings will be required when the project is reviewed for Project Design Approval.

Actual time: 4:12 p.m.

Present: Andrew Blumm, All Blossoms, Design; and Ali Blumm, All Blossoms, Design

<u>Staff comments:</u> Mr. Herics, Case Planner, stated that the project is still in review and its first application deemed incomplete. Mr. Herics recommended this project be heard for Concept Review before resubmittal of the second round of review. Based on the first review, a Minor Zoning Exception (MZE) was noted by zoning staff. The MZE is pending Floor-Area-to lot-Ratio (FAR), and Staff wanted general feedback to see if it would be supportable if the Applicant pursues the MZE for second review.

Public comment opened at 4:23 p.m.

Written correspondence from Jane Gray, Marc and Peggy Kamerling, and Kate Kolstad and Max Baumhefner was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:24 p.m.

Motion: Continue indefinitely to Full Board with comments:

- 1. The Board is in support of the relief of the uncovered parking as it is not visible from the street.
- 2. Study the height of the tower element and the adjacent left massing and how they meet to reduce the visible mass as it appears from the street.
- 3. The Board appreciates the proposed high-quality materials and the Spanish style and all its detailing.
- Action: Sherry/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

(4:25PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN & FINAL APPROVAL

3. <u>1405 ALAMEDA PADRE SERRA</u>

Assessor's Parcel Number:	029-110-025
Zone:	RS-1A
Application Number:	PLN2023-00110
Owner:	Kevin Preloger & Katherine Buck
Applicant:	Erin Lani-Sciotto, Donaldson & Partners
Architect:	Robert Donaldson

(Proposal to renovate an existing 3,521-square-foot, single-unit residence, and construct 341-square-feet of first floor additions, a 139-square-foot second floor addition, a 569 square-foot 2-car carport, a 320-square-foot expansion of an existing second story deck, and a new 158-square-foot covered patio at the basement level. The project includes a new in-ground swimming pool with a cover and associated 671-square-foot permeable pool deck, and new doors and windows. The project will address violations outlined in ENF2019-00643 including an interior remodel. A Minor Zoning Exception

(MZE) is requested from the SFDB to approve an as-built site wall. The proposed total of 3,579 square feet on a 36,345-square-foot lot is 74% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot area ratio.)

Project Design Approval, Final Approval, and a Minor Zoning Exception are requested. Neighborhood Preservation Findings, Hillside Design District & Sloped Lot Findings, Grading Findings, and Minor Zoning Exception Findings are required. The project was last heard on August 28, 2023.

Actual time: 4:52 p.m.

Present: Erin Lani-Sciotto, Donaldson & Partners

Public comment opened at 5:05 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted:

- 1. The Board supports the Minor Zoning Exception for the as built site wall along Alameda Padre Serra at the front property line.
- 2. The Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood. Overall, the mass, bulk, and scale are not increased from the existing development.
 - c. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The Board appreciates high quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside.
 - d. Removal of healthy, non-invasive trees is not proposed for this application. The project does not include the removal of any trees.
 - e. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
 - g. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside due to the massing essentially remaining the same as existing development.
- 3. The Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The development, including the proposed structures and grading, is appropriate to the site, is designed to avoid visible scarring, and does not significantly modify the natural topography of the site or the natural appearance of any ridgeline or hillside due to the proposal for relatively small retaining walls to support the proposed development and the pool.
 - b. The development maintains a scale and form that blends with the hillside by minimizing the visual appearance of structures and the overall height of structures due to the natural materials that are being proposed.
- 4. The Grading Findings have been met as stated in Section 22.69.030 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The proposed grading will not significantly increase siltation in or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages or water storage facilities to which the

property drains as the proposal is required to meet the City's storm water management program requirements.

- b. The proposed grading will not cause a substantial loss of southern oak woodland habitat as no Oaks are proposed to be removed as part of this project.
- 5. The Board finds that the following Minor Zoning Exception criteria have been met:
 - a. The granting of such an exception will not be detrimental to the use and enjoyment of other properties in the neighborhood.
 - b. The improvements are sited such that they minimize impact next to abutting properties.
 - c. The project generally complies with applicable privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting standards in the Single Family Design Board Good Neighbor Guidelines.
 - d. The improvement will be compatible with the existing development and character of the neighborhood.
 - e. The development maintains a scale and form that blends with the hillside by minimizing the visual appearance of structures and the overall height of structures.
 - f. The granting of the MZE and the location of the wall does not create or exacerbate an obstruction of the necessary sightlines for the safe operation of motor vehicles because the portion of the existing wall that was is in the triangular visibility sightline area is being removed as part of this project.

Action: Sherry/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

* THE BOARD RECESSED FROM 5:16 PM TO 5:21 P.M. *

(4:55PM) CONTINUED ITEM: PROJECT DESIGN & FINAL APPROVAL

4.

1231 CALLE CERRITO ALTO

Assessor's Parcel Number:	041-120-037
Zone:	RS-1A
Application Number:	PLN2023-00173
Owner:	Michael Probstel
Applicant:	Natalie Ochsner, Tom Ochsner Architecture & Planning
Architect:	Thomas Ochsner, AIA

(The 2.08-acre site is currently developed with a 5,149-square-foot two-story single-unit residence and 610-square-foot garage. The project consists of a proposal to construct an 1,889-square-foot detached accessory building comprised of a 694-square-foot basement level garage and workshop and a 1,195-square-foot Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) above including a covered deck area at the first floor of the unit and a 70-square-foot covered deck at the second floor. Additional site improvements include a new pool and spa, patio areas, a new driveway serving the ADU, hardscape and landscape improvements, and associated grading. The proposed total of 7,301 square feet on a 2.08 acres lot is 131% of the maximum guideline floor-to-lot-area ratio (FAR). Staff Hearing Officer approval of an Accessory Building Modification for the maximum accessory building floor area on the lot and for the location of the building in the front yard, was approved on November 1, 2023.)

Project Design Approval and Final Approval are requested. Neighborhood Preservation Findings, Grading Findings, and Hillside Design District & Sloped Lot Findings are required. The project was last heard on August 28, 2023.

Actual time:

5:25 p.m.

Present: Liz, Tom Ochners Architect

<u>Staff comments:</u> Mr. Herics stated on behalf of Pilar Plummer, Associate Planner, this project was scheduled for both Project Design Approval and Final Approval but was not able to get structural sheets before scheduling for Final Approval. The Applicant was informed that our guidelines require working construction drawings for Final Approval. The Board will determine if the plans before them today constitute working construction drawings. If they are suitable for Final Approval, they can be approved.

Public comment opened at 5:37 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval:

- 1. The Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The proposed development is consistent with the scenic character of the City and will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
 - b. The proposed development is compatible with the neighborhood, and its size, bulk, and scale are appropriate to the site and neighborhood. The ADU is sited within the hillside.
 - c. The proposed buildings and structures are designed with quality architectural details. The proposed materials and colors maintain the natural appearance of the ridgeline or hillside. The Board supports the architectural language and details provided.
 - d. Removal of healthy, non-invasive trees is not proposed for this application. The proposed project does include the removal of trees. The Arborist Report indicates there is not a significant impact on historic trees, and landmark trees. The proposed project, to the maximum extent feasible, preserves and protects healthy, non-invasive trees with a trunk diameter of four inches or more measured four feet above natural grade. The project does include the removal of trees and a plan to mitigate the impact of such removal by planting replacement trees, in accordance with applicable tree replacement ratios.
 - e. The public health, safety, and welfare are appropriately protected and preserved.
 - f. The project generally complies with the Good Neighbor Guidelines regarding privacy, landscaping, noise, and lighting.
 - g. The development, including proposed structures and grading, preserves significant public scenic views of and from the hillside.
- 2. The Hillside Design District and Sloped Lot criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The development, including the proposed structures and grading, is appropriate to the site, is designed to avoid visible scarring, and does not significantly modify the natural topography of the site or the natural appearance of any ridgeline or hillside. The proposed site improvements and ADU all step down with the natural grade.
 - b. The development maintains a scale and form that blends with the hillside by minimizing the visual appearance of structures and the overall height of structures.
- 3. The Grading Findings have been met as stated in Section 22.69.030 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code:
 - a. The proposed grading will not significantly increase siltation in or decrease the water quality of streams, drainages, or water storage facilities to which the property drains and meets storm water requirements.

b. The proposed grading will not cause a substantial loss of southern oak woodland habitat.

Action:

Lewis/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

(5:25PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL

5. <u>1215 HIGH RIDGE LN</u>

Assessor's Parcel Number:	019-113-033
Zone:	RS-1A
Application Number:	PLN2022-00386
Owner:	Almeroth Family Trust
	Kelly & Kevin Almeroth, Trustees
Applicant/Designer:	David Watkins, David Watkins Design LLC

(Proposal to construct a 5,708-square-foot, one-story, single-unit residence, with an 840-square-foot attached three-car garage, and a 270-square-foot pool cabana, located in the Hillside Design District. Proposed associated site improvements include uncovered patios, entry and garage porches, an uncovered mechanical pad, a new driveway, arbor, and retaining/site walls. The existing residence and garage/storage space will be demolished. SFDB review and approval is required to allow one uncovered guest parking space to be in the front yard without screening. Grading is estimated to be 1,250 cubic yards of cut, 2,000 cubic yards of fill, and 750 cubic yards of fill import. Three Oak trees are proposed for removal and mitigation planting is proposed. The proposed total of 6,818 square feet on a 112,908 square foot lot is 116% of the guideline floor-to-lot area ratio (FAR).)

Final Approval is requested. Project requires substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on February 26, 2024.

Actual time: 5:48 p.m.

Present: David Watkins, Project Designer; Kelly Almeroth, Owner; Gary Ricoh, Winward Design Services; Ricardo Castellanos, Regenerative Landscape and Fred Hunter; Regenerative Landscape

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m.

The following individuals spoke:

1. Beverly Johns Trial

Public comment closed at 6:04 p.m.

- Motion: Final Approval for the Project substantially conforms to the plans that received Project Design Approval on February 26, 2024.
- Action: Lewis/Gerpheide, 3/0/0. Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:16 P.M. *